



Department of Investigation  
80 MAIDEN LANE • NEW YORK, N.Y. 10038  
TELEPHONE 212-825-5900

---

SUSAN E. SHEPARD  
COMMISSIONER

**FINAL REPORT OF AN INVESTIGATION OF MISMANAGEMENT  
AND MISCONDUCT BY THE BUREAU OF WATER SUPPLY POLICE**

**MARCH 1992**



Department of Investigation  
80 MAIDEN LANE • NEW YORK, N.Y. 10038  
TELEPHONE 212-825-5900

---

SUSAN E. SHEPARD  
COMMISSIONER

Office of the Inspector General  
Department of Environmental  
Protection  
51 Chambers Street, Room 1032  
New York, N.Y. 10007  
(212) 566-8372/233-0477

CLOSING MEMORANDUM

DATE: MARCH 4, 1992

I. INTRODUCTION

In November 1991, the Department of Investigation issued a report concerning the management of the Bureau of Water Supply Police ("BWSP"), a unit within the Sources Division of the Department of Environmental Protection ("DEP").<sup>1</sup> The report concluded that there were serious, longstanding management problems within the BWSP.

In response to the report, DEP transferred the Police Administrator for the BWSP, Patrick Murphy, to a new position in DEP and began the process of finding a replacement. In the interim, DEP Commissioner Albert Appleton appointed DEP's Director of Security, Frank Munari, to the position of Acting Police Administrator.

Soon after he assumed his new duties, Munari, during the course of a review of BWSP investigative files at the Beerston Precinct on January 10, 1992, learned of what he described as a

---

<sup>1</sup> A Report on the Enforcement Activity and Overtime Practices of the Department of Environmental Protection Bureau Of Water Supply Police.

"confidential, covert investigation" of a Muslim community on 55 acres of land they own in Delaware County. The site (hereinafter referred to as "the compound") is approximately two miles, on a down slope, away from the Cannonsville Reservoir, in the Town of Tompkins.

During Munari's review of the investigative file folder and conversations with the BWSP personnel involved, Sergeant James Van Tyle and Officer Mark Benedetto, he became concerned with the conduct of the investigation because he was unable to ascertain an acceptable reason for its inception. It was Munari's initial impression that the basis for this investigation may have been solely because of the fact that the community is made up of Black individuals.

Munari notified DEP Deputy Commissioner Iris Weinshall of the BWSP investigation. Weinshall instructed him to report his findings to DOI's Office of the Inspector General for DEP ("OIG"). Subsequently, Commissioner Appleton directed that DEP's Disciplinary Counsel assist the OIG in determining whether there was a legitimate basis for initiating the investigation and whether the investigation was properly conducted and supervised.

## II. SUMMARY OF INVESTIGATIVE FINDINGS

### A. Examination of BWSP file "072488"

On January 22, 1992, Munari provided the BWSP file folder identified as "072488" to the OIG and was interviewed. Munari said that the BWSP investigation was being supervised by BWSP Sergeant James Van Tyle and the officer assigned was Mark Benedetto. Munari said that he has directed that the BWSP investigation be halted until further notice.

Within the file folder are typed notations which report that interviews were conducted with the following six persons:

1. The Superintendent of the Hancock Central School system, evidently to learn if children from the compound were attending school<sup>2</sup>;
2. The Tompkins Town Clerk, to learn if taxes were being paid;

---

<sup>2</sup> According to Munari, VanTyle and Benedetto told him that the School Superintendent said that the Muslim community sent boys to the public school and educated girls at the compound; that the boys were exemplary students; and that several inspections at the compound determined that the education of the girls was being properly conducted.

3. The Tompkins Town Building Inspector, evidently to learn if inspections had been conducted at the compound;
4. The Fire Chief of the Town of Deposit, to learn about a fire that occurred at the compound in December 1988;
5. A neighbor of the compound, who may have reported hearing gun fire at the compound;
6. A reporter for the Walton Reporter, which published an article in February 1988 under the headline, "Sunni Moslems Found Peaceloving Community in Tompkins."

The notations reporting these interviews are very brief and void of great detail. They do not indicate who conducted them and where and when they were held. With one exception, they are not signed or initialed by a BWSP officer, or in another way indicate who prepared them.

Documents in the file also indicate that the BWSP contacted an ammunition company. In addition, the file shows that BWSP officers on at least one occasion stopped and detained a person from the compound.<sup>3</sup>

On another occasion BWSP officers, according to notations in the file folder, entered the compound on the pretext of responding to a complaint from a neighbor regarding a group of dogs running around the area. The report describes a black male, "who appeared to be very nervous and uneasy with their presence." During this visit the unidentified officers recorded license plate numbers and later conducted DMV and name checks with the aid of the Delaware County Sheriff's Office. The report does not provide a time or a date for this activity.

The file also contains the following external documents:

1. Four envelopes containing aerial photographs of the compound, some of which were enlarged;
2. One envelope containing printouts of Department of Motor Vehicles registration inquiries;
3. Tax maps pertaining to the compound;

---

<sup>3</sup> The file shows that BWSP conducted a Department of Motor Vehicle records check and, possibly, a criminal history records check on the person they detained through the Delaware County Sheriff's Department.

4. The newspaper article described above;

5. Additional handwritten notes concerning motor vehicles parked near the compound and other miscellaneous matters, including notes showing the phone numbers of law enforcement agencies, including Interpol, the Bureau of Alcohol, Tobacco and Firearms, and the New York City Police Department;

6. The business cards and identity of two employees of a federal law enforcement agency.

**B. Interview of Sergeant James Van Tyle**

On January 27, 1992, Sergeant Van Tyle was interviewed.

Van Tyle said that the investigation of the Muslim community started as the result of a request from Officer Mark Benedetto. He said that Benedetto had learned from a neighboring property owner to the compound that an employee of a federal law enforcement agency had left his card with the neighbor and requested information such as plate numbers of vehicles from the compound. He said that the federal employee never returned numerous calls made by him and Benedetto and that he never learned the basis or purpose of the federal employee's inquiry.

Without any further information, Van Tyle said that he authorized Benedetto to commence an investigation. This occurred in mid-1988. Van Tyle required no documentation of activities conducted by the BWSP and failed to assign an official BWSP case number. The matter was and still is referred to by the date it began, "Report: 072488 Confidential."

Van Tyle said that he is not aware of any criminal allegations having been made against the Muslim community. He said that after the investigation began, the BWSP received a report by a neighbor of hearing gun fire and marching songs. Up to and including the day he was interviewed, Van Tyle was unable to describe any information obtained by him or any other BWSP officer that indicates that the Muslim community was involved in activities which posed a threat to the reservoirs, the BWSP or anyone else.

Van Tyle described a fire which occurred on December 24, 1988, in a trailer at the compound, which he said went unreported until a neighbor saw the smoke and called the fire department. According to Van Tyle, the fire department was denied access and reported hearing live ammunition discharging as a result of the fire. The Fire Chief also reported seeing, "approximately 150 to 200 Black men and women running around the area."

Van Tyle stated that he was aware that on December 28, 1988, Police Officer Caspere Caratelli, then a member of the Town of Deposit Police Department, entered the compound posing as a helper



of the local sanitation truck which is owned by Caratelli's neighbor, Donald VanDuser. Van Tyle said that he believed that VanDuser was also one of the volunteer firemen who responded to the fire on December 24, and it was he who told Caratelli about the exploding ammunition. Van Tyle said that Caratelli, who has no jurisdiction in the Town of Tompkins, convinced VanDuser to allow the officer to accompany him into the compound to "gather evidence." Van Tyle said that VanDuser complied with the request since he normally goes there to remove garbage. (In August, 1989, Caratelli became a member of the BWSP.)

Van Tyle said that Caratelli, while in the compound, searched the remains of the trailer involved in the fire and discovered a notebook which he placed under his jacket and removed from the property. Caratelli also spoke into a tape recorder that he secreted in a pocket as he moved about the compound. Van Tyle does not know where the original recording is. He said that the notebook was given to Benedetto and eventually to Van Tyle who said it was kept in an unsecured locker at the precinct. Van Tyle said that he was unaware of the contents of the notebook because he never read it and added that he does not think Benedetto did either. No report exists which describes the contents of the notebook.

Van Tyle said that on January 11, 1989, the sanitation truck owner, VanDuser, returned to the compound alone, having been hired by the Muslim community to remove rubbish, and recovered a wooden box of spent shell casings and live ammunition. Van Tyle said that VanDuser turned his find over to Caratelli, who gave the box and its contents to Benedetto. Van Tyle said that the box was placed in the same locker with the notebook. At the time of the interview, Van Tyle produced the box of casings.<sup>4</sup> Van Tyle stated that neither the notebook nor the casings were vouchered. Van Tyle said that under normal conditions items such as this would be vouchered at the BWSP precinct. It is not clear what he meant by the term, "normal conditions." Subsequent to this interview it has been determined from other BWSP personnel that there is no vouchering system at Van Tyle's precinct.

Van Tyle said that he had informed his superior, Captain James Severing, that he was engaged in this investigation. He could not remember when or what he told Severing or what Severing said to him. Van Tyle made no record of this notification.

Van Tyle said that he personally informed Patrick Murphy, the Deputy Chief, Sources Division, early in 1988, and again on at least two other occasions about the investigation of the Muslims. The last time Van Tyle recalls talking to Murphy about this

---

<sup>4</sup> Munari, who was present during the interview, discovered live ammunition with the empty casings much to Van Tyle's surprise.

investigation was in June or July 1991, during a helicopter flight over the compound with the Air National Guard for the purpose of taking aerial photographs. This was done in conjunction with a search for illegally grown marijuana on a nearby strip of NYC land known as "Johnny Brook." BWSP Officer Darwin Finkle took the photographs. The cost of the film and developing was accomplished at City expense. Van Tyle does not know if the City paid for the helicopter fuel or if the cost of the flight came from State coffers. There are no records to confirm Van Tyle's description of these events.

Van Tyle could not provide an explanation for the need of a second set of aerial photographs which merely duplicates pictures taken by Finkle from a fixed wing aircraft in January of 1989. Van Tyle said that the purpose of taking the aerial pictures was to "learn the lay of the land in case they had to go in." There were no reports prepared regarding Van Tyle's notification to Murphy or the taking of aerial photographs and the pertinent expenses involved. (No marijuana was found.)

Van Tyle does not know if Murphy's boss, George Mekenian, Chief, Sources Division, or Joseph P. Conway, Assistant Commissioner, knew of this investigation.

According to Van Tyle, a DOI investigator assigned to the OIG upstate Gardiner office was made aware of this investigation sometime in January 1989, when BWSP asked him to obtain night vision equipment for use during planned surveillance operations at the compound. There are no BWSP records or reports reflecting this matter. Van Tyle said that the investigator, William Pomeroy, was unable to secure the requested equipment.

Subsequent to the Van Tyle interview it was determined from a review of OIG upstate files that on July 26, 1988, Van Tyle had telephoned Pomeroy and advised, "for informational purposes, there is a black Muslim community living within 1 1/2 miles of City property near the Pepacton Reservoir." This matter, carried under IG# C51/88U, was closed on intake on the same date. There was no accompanying information that indicated why the BWSP were interested in the Muslim community. The OIG file folder contains a copy of the previously mentioned news article and a copy of a BWSP report signed by Benedetto, which was also found in the BWSP file.

Van Tyle said that to the best of his knowledge no other records existed regarding this matter. When asked about notes that may have been taken during this investigation, he replied that he was unaware of their present location and indicated that as a general practice they are not kept. (Subsequent to this interview, it was determined that Van Tyle directed Officer Benedetto to "clean-up the file and throw away the notes." The destruction of these notes probably occurred after the OIG asked Acting Police Administrator Munari to obtain the file from Van Tyle.)

When asked why he had not assigned an official case number to this matter, Van Tyle replied that he did not consider this a criminal investigation and therefore did not see the necessity of assigning a case number. He also said that there are no BWSP rules which require that all of their activities be documented and reports prepared.

Van Tyle was asked several times to justify the actions of the BWSP regarding this matter in relationship to their mission of protecting the reservoirs. At one point he placed his hand on the ammunition removed from the compound and said, "In order to contaminate the reservoirs you must have the will to do so, this stuff (meaning the shell casings) tells me they had the will." It is pointed out that the shell casings were not obtained until after he authorized the start of the BWSP inquiries.

### **C. Interview with BWSP Officer Caspere Caratelli**

BWSP officer Caspere Caratelli was interviewed on January 29, 1992.

Caratelli said that he has been a member of the BWSP since August 1989. Prior to that he had been employed by the Town of Deposit Police Department for three years.

Caratelli said that he learned of the Muslim community when he noticed "strangers" shopping in the Town of Deposit. He recalled being told by the Fire Chief and his neighbor, a volunteer fireman, about a fire in a trailer on the compound grounds during which ammunition was going off and that the residents would not let the fire trucks on the property. Caratelli said that he told these facts to the BWSP police "because they have jurisdiction in Tompkins." Caratelli could not explain the authority for that jurisdiction.

Caratelli described how he accompanied his neighbor, Donald VanDuser, into the compound acting as a helper on VanDuser's garbage removal truck. Caratelli told how he had placed a tape recorder in his pocket and talked into it as he proceeded through the compound in search of "evidence." Caratelli could not explain for what purpose he was in need of "evidence." He also described how, while searching the fire-damaged trailer, he discovered a notebook that he secreted under his clothing and removed from the compound. When asked why he neglected to obtain a search warrant before taking this action, Caratelli said that he did not require one. He said that technically he was not acting as a police officer since he was working as a helper on the garbage truck. He explained how it was proper to remove the notebook because VanDuser had contracted with the Muslim community to remove debris from the compound.



Caratelli was shown a typed report from the file folder which he said is a report concerning his visit to the compound. He vouched for its accuracy but he could not identify who prepared it. He said that he prepared his own handwritten report, using the tape recording he made to aid his recollection, which he gave to Benedetto. (That handwritten report is not in the file.) Caratelli said "that he could not produce the original tape cassette because he returned it to the Deposit Police Department and they only have that one cassette, which they use over and over again."

Caratelli said that he decided to enter the compound without consulting Benedetto or Van Tyle and that no one acted as his backup while he was in the compound. (This statement is not consistent with statements by Benedetto, who told OIG staff that Caratelli met with him and Van Tyle before he entered the compound.)

Caratelli said that several days after he entered the compound, VanDuser found shell casings at the compound in a dish washer, which he said was going to be discarded as rubbish, and gave them to Caratelli. Caratelli said that he gave the shell casings and the notebook to Benedetto.

Caratelli, in justifying his actions at the compound, which was outside of his geographical area of employment, stated that he had an obligation to investigate this community because they frequent the Town of Deposit and shop in the local stores.

Caratelli does not recall taking any other action in connection with the investigation of the Muslim community.

#### **D. Interview with BWSP Officer Darwin Finkle**

BWSP officer Darwin Finkle was interviewed on January 29, 1992, with Frank Munari present.

Finkle has been a BWSP officer for 19 years. Prior to that he was employed by the Delaware County Sheriff's Department.

Finkle said that he first heard of this investigation a couple of weeks prior to being directed to take aerial photographs by Benedetto in January 1989. Finkle recalls being told about ammunition being found at the compound, but he said he was not supplied with details.

Benedetto made arrangements to take the aerial photographs with a DEP employee by the name of Donny Jacobs, who owns a fixed wing airplane kept at the Downsville Airport, which is near the compound. Finkle said that he was accompanied by BWSP Officer Pat Gorman. He said that the trip took about an hour. He did not know how Jacobs was compensated for the fuel. Finkle stated that he was

not asked to take the photographs because of any expertise on his part but only because Benedetto knows that he owns a camera.

Finkle said that in the summer of 1991, he was again asked to take aerial photographs by Benedetto. However, he said that this time he was taken up in an Air National Guard helicopter and accompanied by the then BWSP Police Administrator, Patrick Murphy, who sat in the rear and had no conversation with him. Finkle did not know why Murphy was aboard. Prior to taking aerial shots at the compound, Finkle said an aerial search was conducted in another area for illegally grown marijuana. Finkle said that the helicopter picked up Murphy and him at the BWSP headquarters in Walton and, after being up for about 40 minutes, landed at White Bush Airport.

Finkle said that Benedetto met them at White Bush with Murphy's car. Finkle said that Murphy then left in his car, and Benedetto got into the helicopter and went to check on other possible marijuana fields. Finkle confirmed that he took the photographs contained in the file folder. No photographs were taken in connection with the search for marijuana.

Finkle did not provide additional information concerning the investigation of the Muslim community.

#### **E. Interview of BWSP Officer Mark Benedetto**

On January 27, 1992, BWSP Officer Mark Benedetto was interviewed.

Benedetto initially said that the investigation of the Muslim community was based on a referral from Officer Caratelli of the Deposit Police Department. Benedetto stated that, based on information supplied by Caratelli regarding the trailer fire at the compound, "this community posed a threat to the city and officer safety." (It should be noted that the BWSP investigation began on 7/24/88 and, based on statements by BWSP personnel and records they created, there was no information available to them on 7/24/88 which would have reasonably indicated a threat.)

However, later in the interview, Benedetto said he was uncertain about the basis of the investigation. He appeared to be confused and could not provide a satisfactory explanation of why this case was started.

Benedetto said that BWSP Captain Severing and then BWSP Police Administrator Murphy were aware of the investigation.

Benedetto said that Caratelli conducted the undercover operation at the compound on his own time. However, he said that he and Van Tyle met with Caratelli to plan the operation before Caratelli entered the compound.

Benedetto stated that approximately three weeks to a month ago, Van Tyle told him to clean-up the file for this case. Van Tyle told him to type the handwritten notes and throw the originals away.

In a contradiction of information previously supplied by Van Tyle, Benedetto said that BWSP has no vouchering system for evidence. Benedetto stated that in the Beerston Precinct the BWSP has no formal written procedures in place regarding investigations, arrests, interviews, the logging of complaints, the vouchering of evidence, report writing, or even a written mission statement. He explained that the officers "just do what everyone else has always done."

Benedetto explained that the Beerston Precinct in Delaware County serves as the local law enforcement authority for the rural areas. Therefore, he said, the BWSP does not restrict its authority to the Cannonsville and Pepacton Reservoir areas or City property. Referring to BWSP officers, he said: "They are just waiting to be dispatched by the Sheriff's office or the State Police . . . we get bored just driving around the reservoirs."

According to Benedetto, he and his fellow BWSP officers believe they have the authority to investigate any matter brought to their attention.

#### **F. Interview with BWSP Captain James Severing**

On January 30, 1992, Captain James Severing, who is ill and at home on extended leave from the BWSP, was interviewed by telephone due to his inability to appear at the OIG.

Severing said that he does not recall when he was first informed about the BWSP investigation of the Muslim community in the Town of Tompkins, but he does remember that Van Tyle told him about it while it was an ongoing matter. Severing said that Van Tyle told him: "We got wind of a Black Muslim community adjacent to City property and want to check into it." Severing said that Van Tyle did not tell him that there had been any allegations of criminal acts reported in connection with this community. Severing said that he directed Van Tyle to continue with the investigation and to write him a memo if "anything" developed.

Severing said that this type of investigation was not unusual and in fact the BWSP have conducted similar inquiries in the past. He said that they have investigated the "Weathermen," who were located near the Ashokan reservoir and the "JDL," who were in the Town of Ellenville. When asked to produce the files for those investigations Severing said that there were no records kept regarding those cases. He said, "No files, so that it does not become a political football. Nothing was supposed to be in writing because it could hurt an innocent party." Severing said that

Patrick Murphy decides what is and is not a "political football." However, Severing said that he does not remember talking to Murphy or anyone above him regarding this investigation.

Severing could not recall when Van Tyle advised him of this matter. However, he said that after being told that the case was started on or about July 24, 1988, it was his understanding that the investigation only lasted two months and would have been concluded by September.

Severing said that he had "heard" that aerial photographs were taken but he was never informed officially and he never asked about it. According to Severing reports are made at the discretion of the Precinct Commanders and they do not need his approval to start an investigation. Severing said that BWSP officers are not required to memorialize all of their activities with reports and other documentation.

It is Severing's recollection that Investigator Pomeroy of DOI was aware of this investigation but what he was told and to what extent he was advised, Severing could not say.

When provided with the scenario reflecting Caratelli's warrantless search at the Muslim compound, and asked to describe how he would have reacted had he known of its occurrence at the time, Severing said "I would do nothing that would hurt the unit."

#### **G. Interview with Patrick Murphy, former Deputy Chief Sources Division**

On February 7, 1992, Patrick Murphy was interviewed regarding this matter by the DEP Disciplinary Counsel.

Murphy was asked if he was aware that the BWSP had undertaken an investigation of a Black Muslim community near the Cannonsville Reservoir in Delaware County. Murphy questioned the use of the term "investigation" and explained that he was unaware that the activities of the BWSP had ever reached a level that could be characterized as an "investigation." He added that he was aware since last summer that the Beerston Precinct knew of the presence of such a community and they had made occasional observations of the community.

Murphy said that he had taken a helicopter flight some time within the last six months which took him over the Muslim community. He recalled that he made the flight with the Air National Guard and that Officer Finkle was probably present. Murphy said that the purpose of the trip was to surveil the watershed area after BWSP received allegations of marijuana farming on NYC property.



Murphy stated that, after landing, there was a brief discussion among the people present that they had flown over the Muslim community, but, in his words, "no big thing was made of it." He could not recall who was present. Murphy thought he recalled that the discussion did arise that this community may be a "safehouse."

Murphy said that he had no knowledge of a previous flight over the community or any intrusions onto the property.

Murphy said that he had "heard" that the BWSP may have been recruited to participate in a federal program to monitor the location of certain subjects such as foreign diplomats from certain countries. Murphy said that Black Muslims may have been on that list. Accordingly, Murphy added that, although he was aware that the BWSP would occasionally run license checks on people from the Muslim community, he believed it was part of this program. (No evidence was obtained to support Murphy's claim that the BWSP's investigation of the Muslim community is part of a federal program.)

#### H. Interview with George Mekenian, Chief, Sources Division

On February 7, 1992, George Mekenian, Chief of the Sources Division and Patrick Murphy's direct supervisor, was interviewed. The purpose of this interview was to determine to what extent Mekenian was aware of the BWSP investigation.

Mekenian said that he had never been informed of the BWSP investigation of the Muslim community in the Town of Tompkins. He said that his Deputy, Patrick Murphy, should have informed him and had he done so, Mekenian would not have permitted it to continue. Mekenian was shown a map from the BWSP case folder which identifies the location of the Muslim compound in relation to the Cannonsville Reservoir. Mekenian indicated that the compound did not appear to be located within the watershed.

Mekenian does not know what procedures and criteria are required of the BWSP prior to the commencement of an investigation and he is not familiar with police investigative practices. He said that he has not met with Murphy on a regular basis to discuss the BWSP for the last seven years because of his other duties and responsibilities.

He said he did not know that the BWSP, with Murphy's approval, had taken aerial photographs of the Muslim compound. However, when provided with the approximate date of those operations, Mekenian recalled that at the time of the second flight with the Air National Guard helicopter, Murphy told him that the BWSP was assisting another agency. Murphy also told Mekenian that the operation was being conducted at the request of the other agency and made no mention of taking aerial photographs of the Muslim compound. (No evidence has been obtained indicating that the



aerial photographs were taken at the request of or in cooperation with another agency.)

Mekenian said that he was not aware that the BWSP had ever conducted investigations of organizations known as the "Weathermen" and "JDL."

To the best of Mekenian's knowledge, his supervisor, DEP Assistant Commissioner, Joseph P. Conway, has no knowledge of any of the previously mentioned matters because Mekenian did not tell him and it would be highly unusual for Murphy to have done so without informing Mekenian.

### **I. Criminal History Checks**

Notations found in the BWSP file folder indicate that criminal history checks may have been conducted on members of the Muslim community. According to Van Tyle, Department of Motor Vehicles, name checks, and criminal history checks are routinely done for the BWSP by the Delaware County Sheriff's Office without the necessity of providing the Sheriff with a BWSP criminal case number. He does not know what the Sheriff's Office places in its records as justification for a criminal history check, which, according to New York State Police Information Network ("NYSPIN") regulations, requires an official criminal investigation case number. Van Tyle confirmed that he can obtain a criminal history check on anyone for any reason and no record would exist connecting him to that action.

### **III. CONCLUSIONS**

The BWSP investigation lacked any reasonable factual basis. It was the product of irrational fears acted upon by a police unit suffering from inadequate training, ignorance of the law, poor management, supervisory paralysis, and boredom.

The actions of the BWSP demonstrate a breakdown of acceptable law enforcement practices and a disregard for constitutional safeguards. Without benefit of a single allegation or complaint of criminal activity, the BWSP initiated an investigation, which included a warrantless search, aerial photography, and record checks on persons and vehicles believed to be associated with the Muslim community.

The OIG's inquiry was greatly hampered by the fact that Van Tyle failed to properly supervise the conduct of the BWSP investigation. Not only did he fail to ensure that accurate records were prepared by his subordinates but he also directed that handwritten notes, perhaps the only true record of what actions were taken, be destroyed.

The management of the BWSP in the Beerston Precinct is extraordinarily poor. Minimum standards of law enforcement work, from the preparation of reports to the vouchering of evidence, are not followed. Criminal history checks have apparently been conducted in violation of strict federal and State guidelines. "Secret," undocumented investigations, have been conducted.

Supervision is equally poor. BWSP Captain Severing and Police Administrator Murphy knew of the Muslim investigation, but did nothing to insure that it was being conducted properly and for legitimate reasons. Murphy's supervisor, George Mekenian, by his own account, has not found time in the past seven years to review the BWSP and its operations.

The DOI report concerning the BWSP issued in November 1991 recommended that DEP review the operations of the BWSP and the other enforcement, security and inspectional units devoted to the protection of the water supply system. The report suggested that DEP consider consolidating the BWSP and personnel assigned as watershed inspectors into a single security force under centralized command. DOI made this suggestion because it was concerned that the management problems and unprofessional culture in the BWSP had become ingrained. The results of this inquiry have increased DOI's concern about the unprofessional conduct and poor management of the BWSP. It is recommended that DEP move quickly in carrying out the reform of the BWSP begun by the removal of Murphy and the search for a new BWSP Police Administrator.